



Draft Policy 2013-7
Merge IPv4 ISP and End-User
Requirements

2013-7 – Rationale

The policy experience report at ARIN 31, and subsequent discussions, have highlighted that:

- While many aspects of policy are the same for ISPs and end-users, there is enough of a difference (i.e. on the size of allocations/assignments) to push applicants for a favorable definition.
- The NRPM has become an unnecessarily complex document as a result of quickly evolving requirements.
- Small networks may not qualify for transfers and have no way to get space after ARIN's free pool runs out.

This proposal is an attempt to simplify one part of the document in a way that is easily understood even though it intentionally leaves other parts unresolved. This was done to keep the scope to something that could realistically be discussed.

2013-7 – Status

2013-7 is a Draft Policy (not a Recommended Draft), which means the AC will not be sending it to last call immediately after this meeting.

Instead, we are seeking community feedback on the policy, so it can be more fully developed and discussed, and possibly recommended for adoption after a future PPM/PPC.

2013-7 – Summary of changes

	Existing End User Policy	Existing LIR/ISP Policy	Proposed Changes
Minimum initial allocation/assignment	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • /20 single-homed • /24 multi-homed 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • /20 single-homed • /22 multi-homed 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • /22 single-homed • /24 multi-homed
Utilization requirements for initial request	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 25% immediately utilized with a 50% utilization within a year. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Fully utilized a single-homed /20 from upstream provider with a three month plan • Utilize 50% of previous multi-homed assignments of at least a /22 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Initial block would be 80% utilized within three months
Utilization requirements for subsequent request	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • At least 80% utilization on all previous assignments 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • All previous allocations and 80% of most recent allocation 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • All previous allocations and 80% of most recent allocation/assignment
Amount or timeframe of subsequent requests	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 12 months 50% utilized 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Request up to 3 months 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Request up to 12 months

2013-7 – Feedback needed

To further develop 2013-7, the AC needs feedback on questions like these:

- Do you agree with the idea behind this policy?
- Which requirements should we use in each case (when ISP and End User requirements are different)?
- What distinctions should remain between LIR/ ISPs and End Users?

2013-7 – Discussion



2013-7 – NRPM Section Changes

- Remove section 4.1.1 Routability
- Rewrite section 4.1.5 Determination of resource requests
- Remove section 4.1.7 RFC2050
- Rename section header 4.2 Allocations to ISPs (Requirements for Requesting Initial Address Space)
- Remove section header 4.2.1 Principles and promote subsections
- Rewrite section 4.2.1.1 Purpose
- Remove section 4.2.1.4 Slow start
- Remove section 4.2.1.5 Minimum allocation
- Remove section 4.2.2.1 Standard or non-multihomed (and subsections)
- Remove section 4.2.2.2 Multihomed (and subsections)
- Rewrite section 4.2.2 with combined wording to replace sections that are being removed. See details below.
- Replace section 4.2.4 ISP Additional Requests (and subsections)
- Move original section 4.3.5 to new combined section 4.2.7. (unchanged text)
- Remove section 4.2.5 Web Hosting Policy
- Remove section 4.3 End-users-Assignments to end-users (and subsections)
- Remove section 4.9 Minimum allocation for the Caribbean and North Atlantic Islands (and subsections)

2013-7 – Summary of requirement changes

- Minimum allocation for a single-homed ISP is reduced from a /20 to /22.
- Minimum allocation for a multi-homed ISP is reduced from a /22 to a /24.
- The distinction between subscriber members who are before or after a one year anniversary is removed.
- Minimum assignments for a single-homed end user is reduced from a /20 to a /22.
- The requirement that multi-homed, end-user assignments smaller than a /20 be made from a block reserved for that purpose is removed.
- The utilization requirements on an initial end-user assignment changes from 25% immediate, 50% within one year to 80% within three months. This is offset by the lowering of the minimum block size requirement for single-homed networks.
- The timeframe for additional ISP allocations is changed from three months back to one year.
- The special section for the Caribbean region is integrated into the same requirements as the rest of the region with the existing /22 and the addition of an option for a multi-homed /24.

2013-7 – Details (1)

- Remove section 4.1.1 Routability
 - In merging the PI and PA requirements this section seems unnecessary in the newer version. It is also not necessary for the NRPM to suggest who or where an organization obtains resources.
- Renumber and rewrite section (4.1.5 Determination of IP address allocation size)
 - Remove: "Determination of IP address allocation size is the responsibility of ARIN."
 - Replace with: (4.1.1 Determination of resource requests) "Determining the validity of the amount of requested IP address resources is the responsibility of ARIN."
 - Rationale: The specific use of "allocation" does not propagate to end-user assignments in the proposed, merged instance. It is also an attempt to clarify that it is the validity of the request that is more the focus than the amount of resources requested. This does not prevent ARIN from suggesting that a smaller block would be justified where a larger one would not, but also does not suggest that it is ARIN's sole discretion to judge the size of the blocks needed.
- Remove section 4.1.7 RFC2050
 - With RFC2050 being updated the debate needs to occur whether this section should be retained in the principles of the IPv4 policy section. This may be better addressed by ARIN-2013-4.
- Rename section header (4.2 Allocations to ISPs Requirements for Requesting Initial Address Space)
 - New section name: 4.2 Resource Requirements

2013-7 – Details (2)

- Remove section 4.2.1 Principles and promote subsections
 - **In merging the requirements of section 4.2 and 4.3 this section becomes overly complicated and this was an attempt to simplify.**
- Replacement section (4.2.1 Purpose)
 - **Remove: "ARIN allocates blocks of IP addresses to ISPs for the purpose of reassigning that space to their customers."**
 - **Replace with: "ARIN provides blocks of IP addresses to network operators for the purpose of using these resources on their network."**
 - **Rationale: The distinction is removed between end-users and ISP's to provide a unified set of requirements.**
- Remove section 4.2.1.4 Slow start
 - **In an attempt to merge ISP and end user assignments it was desired to not take any functionality away that already existed for one or the other and balance this with transfer requirements.**
- Remove section 4.2.1.5 Minimum allocation
 - **In an attempt to merge ISP and end user assignments it was desired to not take any functionality away that already existed for one or the other and balance this with transfer requirements.**
- Remove section 4.2.2.1 Standard or non-multihomed (and subsections)
 - **This is being replaced with the merged text in the proposed section 4.2.5.**
- Remove section 4.2.2.2 Multihomed (and subsections)
 - **This is being replaced with the merged text in the proposed section 4.2.5.**

2013-7 – Details (3)

- Rewrite section 4.2.2 with combined wording to replace sections that are being removed.
 - **Replacement section (4.2.5 Minimum Size and Utilization)**
 - **A /24 is the minimum sized block to be provided to a multi-homed network.**
 - **A /22 is the minimum sized block to be provided to a single-homed network.**
 - **Through appropriate documentation like reassignment information of blocks from an upstream provider, or other means requested by ARIN, it must be shown how an initial block would be 80% utilized within three months. It must be agreed upon that the newly requested IP address space will be used to renumber out of any current addresses, which will be returned to their upstream provider(s). Blocks smaller than the minimum should be obtained from an upstream provider.**
- Replace section 4.2.4 ISP Additional Requests (and subsections)
 - **Replacement section (4.2.6 Subsequent Requests)**
 - **All previously received IP address resources must be efficiently utilized, and at least 80% of their most recent IP block(s) in order to obtain approval of receiving up to an additional 12-month supply of IP address resources.**
- Move original section 4.3.5 to new combined section 4.2.7. (unchanged text)
- Remove section 4.2.5 Web Hosting Policy
 - **This is being replaced with the merged text in the proposed section 4.2.5 and 4.2.6**
- Remove section 4.3 End-users-Assignments to end-users (and subsections)
 - **This is being replaced with the merged text in the proposed section 4.2.5 and 4.2.6**
- Remove section 4.9 Minimum allocation for the Caribbean and North Atlantic Islands (and subsections)
 - **This is being replaced with the merged text in the proposed section 4.2.5 and 4.2.6**

2013-7 – Diff

The diff is too big to paste here, unfortunately.

It's available at:

https://www.arin.net/policy/proposals/ARIN-prop-190%20proposed_text_changes.pdf